

Comprehensive Arc Flash Risk Assessments

Jim Dollard NFPA Technical Committee Principal Member CESCP

Objectives

- Review risk assessments
- AFRA, are you getting it right?
- How difficult is it? Do we understand the words/terms used?
- Incident energy analysis method of AFRA
- Arc Flash PPE Category Method of AFRA
- How do the methods differ?
- Is one better than the other?
- Training the qualified person



INSPC



Words/Terms, Defined & Undefined

- Article 100 contains 136 definitions
- Not all words/terms used in NFPA 70E are defined
- Estimate?
- Predict?
- Likelihood?





- 70E requires that we estimate:
 - Likelihood of occurrence
 - Incident energy
 - Maximum available fault current, maximum fault-clearing time and minimum working distance





Predict

- Arc ratings (materials) predict ATPA & E_{BT} 50% chance 2ND degree burns or breakopen.....
- (Article 100) **Incident Energy Analysis.** A component of an arc flash risk assessment used to **predict** the incident energy of an arc flash for a specified set of conditions.







130.5 Arc Flash Risk Assessment

- **130.5(A) General.** An arc flash risk assessment shall be performed:
- (1) To identify **arc flash hazards** (when does an arc flash hazard exist? Likelihood?)
- (2) To estimate the likelihood of occurrence of injury or damage to health and the potential severity of injury or damage to health
- (3) To determine if additional protective measures are required, including the use of PPE

Does an Arc Flash Hazard Exist

- Hazard, Arc Flash. (Arc Flash Hazard) A source of possible injury or damage to health associated with the release of energy caused by an electric arc.
- Informational Note No. 1:The likelihood of occurrence of an arc flash incident increases when <u>energized electrical</u> <u>conductors or circuit parts are exposed</u> or when they are <u>within equipment in a guarded or enclosed condition</u>, <u>provided a person is interacting with the equipment in such</u> <u>a manner that could cause an electric arc</u>......



Table 130.5(C) Likelihood of Occurrence..

Task	Operating Condition ^a	Likelihood of Occurrence ^b
Operation of a CB, switch, contactor or starter	Normal Abnormal	No Yes
The Table Notes are enforceable, and they apply in all arc flash risk assessments!		

Table 130.5(C)	Likelihood of C	Occurre	nce
Table 120 5(C) Estimate of the Likelihood of Open	n No.1	a and do Systems	
Table 150.5(6) Estimate of the Likelihood of Occ		Operating Condition ^a	Likelihood of Occurrence ^b
Operation of a CB, switch, conta	ctor or starter	Normal Abnormal	Yes
The Table Notes are enforceabl they apply in all arc flash risk assessments!	e, and Superscript ^b Likelihood & Seve	erity	
	I LI PERF L I		

Notes to Table 130.5(C)

.

• ^b...The estimate of the likelihood of occurrence contained in this table does not cover every possible condition or situation nor does it address severity of injury or damage to health......The likelihood of occurrence must be combined with the **potential severity** of the arcing incident

Щ

Risk Assessment *(it is a process)* Notes to Table 130.5(C) • Risk Assessment. An overall process that: • (1) identifies hazards • ^b..... to determine if additional protective • (2) estimates the likelihood of occurrence of injury or measures are required to be selected and damage to health implemented according to the hierarchy of risk • (3) estimates the potential severity of injury or damage to control identified in 110.3(H). health, and • (4) determines if protective measures are required. In most cases, more than one risk control method • Informational Note: As used in this standard. arc flash risk can be applied assessment and electric shock risk assessment are types of risk assessments.



Perfection, is it Achievable?

- In an arc flash risk assessment, is perfection attainable?
- For comparison, consider an employee, trained in PFAS, everything is right....
- If they fall, we are guaranteed ZERO injury right?
- What have we done?????
- Under the circumstances, we did the best we could.....

Arc Flash Risk Assessment

- Many factors come into play, each assessment is different
- Always looking for a quote to help things make sense
- Winston Churchill
- "True genius resides in the capacity for evaluation of uncertain, hazardous, and conflicting information."
- Alan Jackson & Jimmy Buffet
- "It's five o'clock somewhere"

Arc Flash Risk Assessment

- Where are we today?
- Do you work exclusively in labeled environments?
- The arc flash PPE category method, when applied, requires the parameters be met
- The incident energy analysis method requires accurate data collection, accurate input and continuous maintenance of the analysis

Arc Flash Risk Assessment Methods

- **130.5(F) Arc Flash PPE.** One of the following methods shall be used for the selection of arc flash PPE:
- (1) The incident energy analysis method in accordance with 130.5(G)
- (2) The <u>arc flash PPE category method</u> in accordance with 130.7(C)(15)

Either, but not both, methods shall be permitted to be used on the same piece of equipment. The results of an incident energy analysis to specify an arc flash PPE category in Table 130.7(C)(15)(c) shall not be permitted. (discussed later)

ШŰ

Incident Energy Analysis

- Requires collection of data
- Software programs produce labels based upon the data provided. Data collected includes but is not limited to:
- Available Fault Current
- Conductor material, length, size, installation (metal/nonmetallic)
- OCPD type, clearing time settings, arc energy reduction methods
- Voltage, System, Arc gap

Incident Energy Analysis, 130.5(G)

• 130.5(G) Incident Energy Analysis Method. The incident energy exposure level shall be based on the working distance of the employee's face and chest areas from a prospective arc source for the specific task to be performed. Arc-rated clothing and other PPE shall be used by the employee <u>based on the incident energy</u> <u>exposure associated with the specific task</u>......

Ш

Incident Energy Analysis, 130.5(G)

• **130.5(G) Incident Energy Analysis Method....** Recognizing that <u>incident energy increases as the</u> <u>distance from the arc flash decreases</u>, additional PPE shall be used for any parts of the body that are closer than the working distance at which the incident energy was determined......

Incident Energy Analysis, 130.5(G)

- 130.5(G) Incident Energy Analysis Method..... The incident energy analysis shall take into consideration the characteristics of the overcurrent protective device and its fault clearing time, including its condition of maintenance.
- The incident energy analysis shall be <u>updated when</u> <u>changes occur in the electrical distribution system that</u> could affect the results of the analysis. The incident energy analysis shall also be <u>reviewed for accuracy at</u> <u>intervals not to exceed 5 years</u>......

INSPC

Incident Energy Analysis, 130.5(G)

- 130.5(G) Incident Energy Analysis Method.....
- Informational Note: Changes that could affect the results of the incident energy analysis include changes made by <u>utilities or other entities, such as transformer sizing, as</u> <u>well as modifications to protective devices or changes to</u> <u>protective settings.</u>
- <u>Table 130.5(G) identifies arc-rated clothing</u> and other PPE requirements and <u>shall be permitted</u> to be used with the incident energy analysis method of selecting arc flash PPE.





Arc Flash PPE Category Method

- **130.7(C)(15)** Arc Flash PPE Category Method. The requirements of 130.7(C)(15) shall apply when the arc flash PPE category method is used for the selection of arc flash PPE.
- Informational Note: For both ac and dc systems, the arc flash PPE category of the protective clothing and equipment is generally <u>based on determination of the estimated exposure level.</u>

N 14 <u>* 19 8</u> 2 8 8 8 8 8 8 8

Arc Flash PPE Category Method

- 130.7(C)(15) Arc Flash PPE Category Method....
- (a) Alternating Current (ac) Equipment. When the arc flash risk assessment performed in accordance with 130.5 indicates that arc flash PPE is required and the arc flash PPE category method is used for the selection of PPE for ac systems in lieu of the incident energy analysis of 130.5(G), Table 130.7(C)(15)(a) shall be used to determine the arc flash PPE category. The estimated maximum available fault current, maximum fault-clearing times, and minimum working distances for various ac equipment types or classifications are listed in Table 130.7(C)(15)(a).....



Arc Flash PPE Category Method

- 130.7(C)(15) Arc Flash PPE Category Method....
- (a) Alternating Current (ac) Equipment......<u>An incident energy</u> <u>analysis</u> shall be required in accordance with <u>130.5(G)</u> for the following:

(1) Power systems with <u>greater than the estimated maximum</u> available fault current

(2) Power systems with <u>longer than the maximum fault clearing</u> times

Щ

(3) Less than the minimum working distance

Arc Flash PPE Category Method

- 130.7(C)(15) Arc Flash PPE Category Method.
- (c) <u>Protective Clothing and Personal Protective Equipment</u> (<u>PPE</u>). Once the arc flash PPE category has been identified from <u>Table 130.7(C)(15)(a)</u> or <u>Table 130.7(C)(15)(b)</u>, <u>Table 130.7(C)(15)(c)</u> shall be used to determine the required PPE. <u>Table 130.7(C)(15)(c)</u> lists the requirements for PPE <u>based on arc flash PPE categories 1 through 4</u>. This clothing and equipment shall be used when working within the arc flash boundary. <u>The use of PPE other than or in addition to that listed</u> shall be permitted provided it meets 130.7(C)(7).

Arc Flash PPE Category Method

• 130.7(C)(15) Arc Flash PPE Category Method.

乳 光 <u>密言や</u> <u>条</u> の (1997) (1

Apples and Oranges

• 130.5(F) Arc Flash PPE.....

- (1) <u>incident energy analysis method in</u> accordance with 130.5(G).....
- (2) <u>arc flash PPE category method</u> in accordance with 130.7(C)(15)

Either, but not both, methods shall be permitted to be used on the same piece of equipment...... The results of an incident energy analysis to specify an arc flash PPE category in Table 130.7(C)(15)(c) shall not be permitted

Apples and Oranges

- An incident energy analysis cannot be used to specify an arc flash PPE category in Table 130.7(C)(15)(c)
- Why?
- Everybody wants an easy button!
- The Arc Flash PPE Category Method is primarily conservative
- For example: an IE result of 7.5 cal/cm² cannot be used to specify Arc Flash PPE Category 2 (8 cal/cm²)
- For example: an IE result of 8.5 cal/cm² cannot be used to specify Arc Flash PPE Category 3 (25 cal/cm²)

Щ<mark>етр</mark> 🛃 🖾 🕸 🖶 📓 **NSPC**

Misapplication

- · Both methods are easily misapplied
- For example, when applying the Arc Flash PPE Category Method, users may not estimate available fault current and clearing time
- Where an incident energy analysis is performed, was the data collection done properly? Garbage in = garbage out.
- Do you read the executive summary for the incident energy analysis? Was the engineer overly conservative?
- Did they back into an AF PPE Category? Are they keeping up with changes, and reviewing every five years?

Arc Flash Labeling Requirements 2023 NEC

• 110.16(B) Service Equipment and Feeder Supplied Equipment. In other than dwelling units, in addition to the requirements in 110.16(A), <u>a permanent arc flash</u> <u>label</u> shall be field, or factory applied to <u>service</u> <u>equipment and feeder supplied equipment rated 1000</u> <u>amperes or more.</u> The arc flash label shall be in accordance with applicable industry practice and *include the date the label* was applied. <u>The label shall</u> <u>meet the requirements of 110.21(B).</u>

Arc Flash PPE Category Method Applying 130.7(C)(15)(a)

- Assume that an ESWC cannot be established, (troubleshooting, voltage testing) in 400-amp panelboard at 208/120-volts
- Justification, 110.2(B) Exceptions
- Normal Operation
- Opening energized disconnect to create an ESWC
- Infeasibility

- Additional hazards or increased risk
- Less than 50-volts

Applying 130.7(C)(15)(a)

- Determine equipment category and parameters (*Panelboard at 208/120-volts, 400-amp MCCB*)
- Estimate available fault current (Maximum 25 kA)
- Estimate clearing time (Maximum 2 cycles)
- Estimate working distance (Minimum 18-inches)

Щ

• When in compliance, choose PPE from Table 130.7(C)(15)(c)

Is there more than one risk control method that can be applied?

Other risk control/reduction methods

Applying 130.7(C)(15)(a)

- Potential for human error
- Operating condition of equipment and OCPD's

• In addition to the five steps identified, determine:

Condition of maintenance (Annex S)

FOR REFERENCE OF NECA 2024 SAFETY PROFESSIONALS CONFERENCE ATTENDEES ONLY



FC ² available fault current calculator SELECT SYSTEM TYPE Welcome to Eaton's Bussmanne wes FC ² Available Fault Current Calculator! Please select your system type. THREE PHASE SINGLE PHASE	Certain a sembling your system by ang the "Add To My System" button below.
·····································	·····································

FC ² available fault current calculator Select the component you would like to add resystem.	FC2 available fault current calculator Image: Source of the state of
ADD TRANSFORMER TO SYSTEM	YES, I HAVE A KNOWN PRIMARY FAULT CURRENT
ADD CONDUCTOR RUN TO SYSTEM	NO, ASSUME INFINITE CURRENT ON PRIMARY
ADD BUS RUN TO SYSTEM	
· [1] · [1]	In I

FC ² available fault current calculator	ADD TO MY SYSTEM
THREE-PHASE	START NEW SYSTEM
ADD TRANSFORMER	41,638-amps
Enter the values below to add a transformer to your system.	
Avail. Fault Current (on Primary) Infinite	
*Transformer KVA	INFINITE PRIMARY SOURCE
750	
*Voltage Secondary (L-L)	TRANSFORMER - TI
208	КУА 750
*Impedance (%Z)	Voltage secondary 208
5	%Z 5 %Z TOL No Change
%Z Tolerance	FAULT - X1
□ -10% Max Fault 0% No Change □ mr Fault	Itotal s.c. (L-L-L) 41,638 AMPS
	Voltage (L-L) 208 V
	CREATE LABEL DELETE

ADD TO MY SYSTEM	
START NEW SYSTEM	
EMAIL SYSTEM DIAGRAM	THREE-PHASE
	SELECT COMPONENT
INFINITE PRIMARY SOURCE	Select the component you would like to add to the system.
TRANSFORMER - T1	ADD TRANSFORMER TO SYSTEM
KVA 750	ADD CONDUCTOR RUN TO SYSTEM
Voltage secondary 208	
%2 5 %	ADD BUS RUN TO SYSTEM
FAULT - X1	ADD MOTOR CONTRIBUTION TO CURRENT VOLTAGE (208 V)
Voltage (L-L) 208 V	
CREATE LABEL DELETE	V. PER N. PER N







Estimate Fault Clearing Time

- If we were to place each of these devices on a table in class, could your qualified persons discuss:
- Typical applications
- Typical clearing times
- Which devices have an instantaneous override
- Which devices can be set without an instantaneous trip setting?

Щ

Estimate Fault Clearing Time

- Are qualified persons trained to always determine the operating condition of OCPD's and their condition of maintenance?
- Which need maintenance?
- How often?

• What type of device are they typically working on the load side of?

ĨĹ

Estimate Fault Clearing Time

- Informational Note No. 1 to Table 130.7(C)(15)(a): The following are typical fault clearing times of overcurrent protective devices:
- (1) 0.5 cycle fault clearing time is <u>typical for current-limiting</u> <u>fuses and current-limiting molded case circuit breakers when</u> <u>the fault current is within the current limiting range.</u>
- (2) 1.5 cycle fault clearing time is <u>typical for molded case circuit</u> <u>breakers rated less than 1000 volts with an instantaneous</u> <u>integral trip.</u>

ЪЦ

Estimate Fault Clearing Time

- Informational Note No. 1 to Table 130.7(C)(15)(a):
- (3) 3.0 cycle fault clearing time is typical for <u>insulated case</u> <u>circuit breakers rated less than 1000 volts with an</u> <u>instantaneous integral trip or relay operated trip.</u>
- (4) 5.0 cycle fault clearing time is <u>typical for relay operated</u> circuit breakers rated 1 kV to 35 kV when the relay operates in the instantaneous range (i.e., "no intentional delay").

Щ

FOR REFERENCE OF NECA 2024 SAFETY PROFESSIONALS CONFERENCE ATTENDEES ONLY

豢



Arc-Flash PPE Category	PPE	
1	Arc-Rated Clothing, Minimum Arc Rating of 4 cal/cm ² (16.75 J/cm ²) ^a	Arc-Rated Clothing, Minimum Arc Rating of 8 cal/cm ² (33.5 J/cm ²) ^a
	Arc-rated long-sleeve shirt and pants or arc-rated coverall	Arc-rated long-sleeve shirt and pants or arc-rated coverall
	Arc-rated face shield ^b or arc flash suit hood	Arc-rated flash suit hood or arc-rated face shield ^b and arc-rated balaclava
	Arc-rated lacket, parka, high-visibility apparel, rainwear, or hard bat liner (AN) ^f	Arc-rated jacket, parka, high-visibility apparel, rainwear, or hard hat liner (AN) ^f
	Protective Equipment Hard hat Safety glasses or safety goggles (SR) Hearing protection (ear canal inserts) ^c Heavy-duty leather gloves, arc-rated gloves, or rubber insulating gloves with protectors (SR) ^d Leather footwear ^e (AN)	Protective Equipment Hard hat Safety glasses or safety goggles (SR) Hearing protection (ear canal inserts) ^c Heavy-duty leather gloves, arc-rated gloves, or rubber insulating gloves with protectors (SR) ^d Leather footwear ^e
	剛 ¤ ��� & 图 象 馨 圖 NSPC	

FOR REFERENCE OF NECA 2024 SAFETY PROFESSIONALS CONFERENCE ATTENDEES ONLY

N'S PC





FOR REFERENCE OF NECA 2024 SAFETY PROFESSIONALS CONFERENCE ATTENDEES ONLY

